



FPF_0CP_04_0069

Universidade de São Paulo Faculdade de Educação

Cidade Universitária

The Literacy Training Campaign (MOVA-Sao Paulo): A study of Policy Planning, Implementation and Learners' Outcomes.

1. Introduction.

When the Partido Trabalhista (Workers' Party or PT) won the Municipal elections of November 15, 1988 in Sao Paulo, a natural choice for Secretary of Education was Paulo Freire, a well-known Brazilian socialist pedagogue, one of the originators of popular education in Latin America who also inspired the constitution of Theology of Liberation. A member of the party since 1979, and President of the Workers University sponsored by the Partido Trabalhista in Sao Paulo, Secretary of Education Freire is in charge of 654 schools with 700,000 students, from K1-8, and also in charge of adult education and literacy training in the City of Sao Paulo, one of the largest cities in Latin America.

This research will study the policy implications of implementing a socialist pedagogy in the hard-core city of capitalist Brazil, with a particular focus on contrasting the rhetoric with the realities of day-to-day policymaking in Sao Paulo. A campaign of literacy training (MOVA-Sao Paulo) was announced by the end of October 1989, and has been launched in January 1990. In addition to this study of policy planning and implementation, a study of concrete impacts of literacy training in the life of learners will be undertaken, with a follow-up methodology.

2. Background to this study.

Secretary of Education Paulo Freire has argued in his academic work that few human encounters are exempt from oppression of one kind or another; by virtue of race, class or sex, people tend to be victims and/or perpetrators of oppression. He points out that racism, sexism or class exploitation are the most salient forms of dominance and oppression, but he recognizes that there exists oppression on the grounds of religious beliefs, political affiliation, national origin, age, size, and physical and intellectual handicap.

Freire, starting from a psychology of oppression, influenced by the work of psychotherapists such as F. Fanon and E. Fromm, has developed a **Pedagogy of the Oppressed**, resorting to education to improve the human condition, counteracting the effects of a psychology of oppression, and ultimately contributing to what he considers the "ontological vocation of mankind": humanization. In the introduction to his <u>Pedagogy of the Oppressed</u>, he claims that: "From these pages I hope at least the following will endure: my trust in the people, and my faith in men and in the creation of a world in which it will be easier to love" (page 19).

Freire's <u>Pedagogy of the Oppressed</u>, which has been influenced by a myriad of philosophical currents including Phenomenology, Existentialism, Christian Personalism, Humanist Marxism and Hegelianism, calls for dialogue and ultimately conscientization as a way to overcome domination and oppression among and between human beings. Conscientization is the individual consciousness (awareness) that, by exercising a dialogue, in a communal searching, becomes more aware of the real nature of his oppression and moves, together with others, toward the changing of their oppressive environment. Since returning to Brazil in 1979, Freire has attempted to implement his educational philosophy in his own country, and his appointment as Secretary of Education of the City of Sao Paulo in January 1989 creates an unique opportunity for him. His socialist goals, however, should be considered in the framework of the new democracy and constitutional reform in Brazil.

A new constitution was approved in Brazil in October 1988, which included the drafting of new educational legislation; such key issues as subsidies to private education, the transfer of funds from federal and elementary education, the quality of education and the teaching profession have been discussed in parliament. Illiteracy, consistently in decline since the country was proclaimed a Republic in 1889, is once again on the rise. While the new constitution calls for the eradication of illiteracy within 10 years, many researchers criticize this goal as a "pipe dream". The new literacy campaign, Movement of Literacy Training or MOVA-Sao Paulo was announced in October, to be launched in January, 1990, with the goal of making 60,000 literate within six months. With the decentralization of financial resources and the promulgation of the new constitution, and while the problem of literacy training seem to be returning to the top of government agendas, state and local authorities have taken a more active role in governance and policy making. Freire's concientization approach and the launching of MOVA-Sao Paulo is an example of the new role of local governments; a role that is not exempted from conflicts and contradictions.

3. Research focus.

This research has two related research focus. First a study of policy making, policy planning and implementation of the campaing; second, a study of the private returns for adult learners, i.e. the outcomes of the campaign in terms of learners social and political consciousness, social mobility, income and employment.

3.1. First Research Focus: Policy Planning and Implementation.

In the first dimension of the study, the research problem consists of knowing why policy decisions are made in adult education and literacy training, how are the decisions

articulated, planned and carried out, which are the most relevant nongovernmental actors in the formulation and operationalization of policy, what is the role of the bureaucracy at municipal, state and federal levels, and what are the fundamental systemic processes from the origins to the implementation of policy (Torres, 1990; Fagerlind and Saha; 1984; Lindblon, 1968; Offe, 1984, 1985; La Belle, 1986).

In designing a general model for the analysis of public policy, we understand that every analysis of public policy requires historical-structural discussion and understanding of the nature of the state and political regime in question. In this particular case, a socialist administration ruling the key City of capitalist Brazil poses many theoretical and analytical challenges. In addition, the personification of a new educational policy in the figure of Paulo Freire, an internationally known intellectual, whose "Pedagogy of the Oppressed" has motivated hundreds of radical experiments in education word-wide, involve additional excitement for the research endeavor. In fact, this research will study probably the last major large scale literacy training program that Freire will be involved personally, this time in his own country, and in the capacity of policy-maker and not advisor.

The model of analysis will be a conventional evaluation of literacy campaigns (Bhola, 1981; 1984; Torres, 1990) including a qualitative and quantitative assessment of inputs, processes of transformation and outputs of the campaign, contrasting intended goals with outcomes of the campaign (La Belle, 1986; Arnove, 1986), a particularly the interactions, contradictions and correspondences between the different levels of governance (municipal, state and federal) in terms of appropriations and use of resources, and in terms of normative principles of literacy training.

3.2. Second Focus: A Study of Economic, Social, Political Returns of Literacy Training for Learners.

In general, the educational clientele for programs of literacy training are made up of a population of rural origin, or urban migrants with a very recent campesino past. This clientele is localized in the large suburban areas of the the grand metropolises, or the relatively least developed geographic areas of a country. Many of them belong to ethnic groups, are monolingual, and the rates of illiteracy are higher for groups over 25 years old. The illiteracy of women is proportionally higher than that of men (CNTE-UNESCO, 1982: 17-19; Schmelkes, 1979; Solari, 1982: 21-34).

The goals assigned to basic adult education varies from offering positive attitudes toward cooperation, work, family, community and national development or a better individual apprenticeship, to functional literacy training and the teaching of basic arithmetic operations; from promoting a scientific approach in health, agriculture and related areas, to the learning of knowledge and functional skills for work; from facilitating entry into labour markets or strengthening occupational opportunities for individuals, to facilitating functional knowledge and the skills necessary for civic or political participation (Bee, 1981: 39-56; Bhola, 1981: 6-22; Blaug, 1966: 393-415; Levine, 1982: 249-266; Lowe, 1975; Mbilinyi, 1981: 11-17; Schmelkes, 1982: 463-481; Torres, 1980a, 1984a).

The magnitude of the problem of illiteracy and basic adult education, and the importance of the objectives assigned to them, have in recent decades inspired important efforts by international organizations like UNESCO, as well as governments in the region. These efforts pretend to resolve the problem, or at least reduce the incidence of illiteracy in absolute terms in the total adult population. This intention of designing effective strategies in basic adult education has one of its most important expressions in

the Experimental World Program in Literacy developed by UNESCO which initiated and coordinated this program between 1965-1975 in China, Tanzania, India, Vietnam, Iran, Mali, Brazil, Ecuador, and Somalia (Bhola, 1984; Arnove & Graff, 1987). Systematic evaluations of its results did not suggest promising results, but with the exception of the Tanzanian experience, quite a substantial failure in meeting the stated goals for literacy training (Pescador, 1981; Bhola, 1984; Arnove & Graff, 1987).

In Latin America the evaluation of massive literacy campaigns and basic adult education has presented uneven results. Beyond the complexities of the theme are the difficulties of establishing exactly which are the contributions of these programs and educational policies to the productivity of labour, increases in employment (and the employability of the work force), and/or modifications in the income or the rising occupational mobility of the beneficiaries of such programs. That is to say, the outcome is that it is difficult to establish the real relationships between basic adult education and economic and social development (La Belle, 1980; La Belle and Verhine, 1981.

Much of the research in Latin America on these issues introduces the following questions: Is the contribution of adult education decisive for increasing the productivity of workers and campesinos?; Is this increase in productivity directly reflected in a better occupation or salary?; Is it possible to attribute the increase in the GNP, which cannot be mediated by the productivity of capital, to the improvement in the quality of the human resources of the country?; and if this were the case, is there a specific contribution of adult education to this process?; Is overcoming illiteracy--as an introduction to the initial levels of formal education-- an inevitable necessity and precondition for a country to develop?; Are learning how to read, write and calculate at an elementary level reflected in an improvement, in the short run, of the incomes and quality of life?; Does the skill of the literate person presuppose an automatic increase in productivity?; What is the real utility of

literacy in rural areas?; What are the contributions of adult education to the opportunities of self-employment for graduates? In other words, what is the concrete contribution of massive programs of adult education to employment, incomes, occupational and social mobility, and the cultural capital of the newly literate?

Some of the most conventional responses with respect to the contribution of adult education to development suggest, on the one hand, that literacy and basic adult education contribute to economic development by means of the increase in the productivity of the newly literate, and at the same time, enhance the levels of productivity of those who work with the newly literate (the so-called spillover effect). On the other hand, this contribution is verified in the reduction in the costs of the transmission of useful information in matters of health or nutrition to a population which knows how to read and write. Finally, it is argued that adult basic education serves as an instrument of selection for potentially more talented subjects, enhancing their possibilities of social mobility and, at the same time, facilitating in the rest of society a more elastic response to a modification in economic incentives. In sum, basic adult education (including literacy training) would be very useful for that part of the labour force with low levels of qualification and have a strong tendency to migrate, making them more employable, as well as reducing unemployment, underemployment and inter-regional and international migration (Blaug, 1966: 393-394; La Belle and Verhine, 1978; Phillips, 1970; Waiser, 1980: 4).

Nevertheless, despite these theories regarding the relations between adult education and labour market, there does not existent adequate knowledge, based on empirical research, on the character of such relations in the experiments developed in Latin America. Understanding the connections between adult education and labour markets, as well as understanding in greater detail the impact of massive literacy

programs, constitute indispensable prerequisites for continuing on a firmer basis the process of educational planning and decision-making in the area.

This project, by selecting a relevant sample from students that have enrolled at MOVA-Sao Paulo--interviewing them at the beginning of their education, and approximately a year or year and a half after they have graduated--will provide very useful information on the private returns of literacy training. If possible, we will attempt to identify a sample of illiterates who refuse to enroll in MOVA-Sao Paulo. Following the same model than with adult learners, we will interview illiterates twice, at the same time we interview the adult learners. Finally, using simple statistical techniques (i.e. comparing the mean of both groups, using chi-square and paired t-tests) we will assess if there is any significative difference in the variables involved between the group that has undergone literacy training, and those that refuse to enroll.

4. Specific aims of the project.

1.- A main focus of the analysis will be policy planning and implementation of MOVA-Sao Paulo. In this regard, research questions include: How is literacy training implemented in the City of Sao Paulo? What is the role attributed to mass organizations, including Church-based organizations, students' organizations, and teachers' organizations; What is the role of the Partido Trabalhista and other political parties in designing and implementing this Literacy campaign? How has the established educational bureaucracy in the City of Sao Paulo reacted to the new socialist administration headed by Freire and to the launching of the literacy campaign? Finally, what is the role that Paulo Freire himself plays in setting up, implementing and evaluating the campaign?

- 2.-Central issues for the study of the literacy campaign are the following: What are the socio-political and economic objectives of the campaign? What is the organizational model followed in the campaign? How does it relate to previous experiences that were to some extent inspired in Freire's conscientization model (particularly the experience in Guinea-Bissau, but also literacy training in Cabo Verde, Sao Tomé e Principe and most recently Nicaragua)? How is the curriculum designed? Is the methodology of the generative word used--with dialogue and participation as key elements in curriculum design? If so, how is it adequate to the needs of adult learners in the State of Sao Paulo? How is the evaluation of the campaign organized? How is the campaign financed? What is the role of educational research in the campaign?
- 3.- Finally, what indications can be obtained from the results of the campaigns in terms of economic, political, social and cultural returns of literacy training for the adult learners?
- 5.- Significance of Pedagogy of the Oppressed and of the book resulting from this research project.

The impact of Freirean pedagogy of the oppressed in Western societies cannot be restricted to literacy training. Problem-posing education, or the methodology for thematic research, two of the main theoretical and methodological innovations resulting from Freire's work, have been implemented not only in Social Studies and Curriculum Studies in Adult Education, Secondary Education and Higher Education, but also in such diverse subjects as the teaching of Mathematics and Physics, Educational Planning, Feminist Studies, Romance Languages, Educational Psychology, Critical Reading and Writing and so forth. Paulo Freire's work during the last two decades has been the subject of hundreds of Ph.D. dissertations. The increasing bibliographies of his work are now

amounting to thousands of references, from those who implemented any aspect of Freire's proposal to those who argue critically against them. While Freire's work is known because of his experiences in the Third World, there are a number of experiences that relate the educational work of Paulo Freire to the problematics of industrial advanced societies. More than six thousand references have been compiled by Donaldo Macedo in his Bilingual-ESL Project at the University of Massachusetts, Boston Harbor Campus; similarly, more than one thousand references to the earlier work by Freire have been compiled in the Special Collection Section on Paulo Freire at the OISE, in Toronto, Ontario.

In spite of this diversity of materials, there is not yet a comprehensive study of the implementation of a progressive political philosophy of education in policymaking (Gerhardt, 1985). By filling the gap in the research on pedagogy of the oppressed and policy implementation and by focusing on the relationships between progressive pedagogy, literacy training, local politics and educational reform, the book resulting from this research will be very relevant and somewhat unique in the context of current scholarship. Since MOVA-Sao Paulo is framed in an overall attempt to reform, from a socialist perspective, the municipal system of education in the most modern city of capitalist Brazil, this research will offer specific insights on the limits and possibilities of socialist policies in capitalist educational systems. Similarly, it may increase the knowledge of the applicability of radical educational techniques and policy recommendations not only in developing but also in the industrial advanced societies. Finally, evaluations of literacy campaings, using follow-up methods are scarce in the Third World. This research will offer invaluable evidence on the economic, social, political and cultural returns of literacy training for adult learners after a year of finishing their programs.

6.- Methods and Procedures of this research.

The methodology will consist of analysis of documentation and bibliography, participatory observation, and qualitative interviewing, i.e. conversations with key informants participants in community projects, literacy training students, literacy teachers, high ranking officials in educational settings, and Freire himself. A follow up survey of a sample of learners, interviewed when they begin their literacy training and a year after they have concluded their studies will be carried out.

In concluding, let us emphasize that the timing for this research is essential. The research to be undertaken will include an analysis of the first stage of literacy training (January-June, 1990), the post-literacy training stage (July-December, 1990), and the evaluation phase of the campaign (January-June 1991). The possibility of conducting research on a literacy campaign which is inspired on socialist principles and conducted by a municipal socialist administration but takes place at the heart of capitalist Brazil is an exceptional historical circumstance. Similarly, the possibility of designing the research at the same time that the campaign is being planned and conducting the research on parallel lines to every stage of the unfolding campaign is an unique opportunity.